



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 17, 2004

Ms. Denise G Obinegbo
Open Records Specialist
Richardson Police Department
P.O. Box 831078
Richardson, Texas 75083-1078

OR2004-1158

Dear Ms. Obinegbo:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 196288.

The City of Richardson Police Department (the "department") received a request for certain incident reports. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that certain information has been redacted from the submitted documents. You do not assert, nor has our review of our records indicated, that you have been granted a previous determination to withhold any such information without seeking a ruling from this office. Because we can discern the information that has been redacted, being deprived of this information does not inhibit our ability to make a ruling *in this instance*. Nevertheless, be advised that a failure to provide this office with requested information generally deprives us of the ability to determine whether information may be withheld and leaves this office with no alternative other than ordering that the redacted information be released. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D)* (governmental body must provide this office with copy of "specific information requested").

We also note that the submitted information includes an arrest warrant and supporting affidavit. The 78th Legislature recently amended article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure to add language providing:

The arrest warrant, and any affidavit presented to the magistrate in support of the issuance of the warrant, *is public information*, and beginning immediately when the warrant is executed the magistrate's clerk shall make a copy of the warrant and the affidavit available for public inspection in the clerk's office during normal business hours. A person may request the clerk to provide copies of the warrant and affidavit on payment of the cost of providing the copies.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 15.26 (emphasis added). Thus, the warrant is public under article 15.26. Although you assert that information contained in this document is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code, the exceptions found in the Public Information Act do not apply to information that is made public by other statutes. *See* Open Records Decision No. 525 (1989) (statutory predecessor). Therefore, you must release an unredacted copy of the warrant and its supporting affidavit to the requestor.

We next note that the department has not complied with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply not later than the tenth business day after the date of receiving the written request. You state that the department received the present request for information on November 17, 2003. The department did not request a decision from this office until December 4, 2003. Consequently, the department failed to request a decision within the ten-business-day period mandated by section 552.301(b) of the Government Code.¹

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). You have not demonstrated a compelling reason to withhold the information under section 552.108, which protects law enforcement interests and is a discretionary exception. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 586 (1991) (governmental body may waive predecessor to section 552.108); 522 at 4 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). However, as sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code may provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address these exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977) (presumption of openness overcome by showing that information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests).

¹ You indicate that the elapsed time included two non-working holidays. However, even taking the two holidays into account, we find that the department failed to comply with the ten-business-day deadline.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”) is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. You contend that some of the submitted information is data obtained from TCIC or NCIC. However, you do not explain, nor does our review indicate that any of the submitted information was generated by NCIC or TCIC. Therefore, you may not withhold any of the submitted information as CHRI.

We note that the submitted information contains a social security number. A social security number or “related record” may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number in the file is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state; or
- (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state of a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.

You must withhold the Texas driver's license information that we have marked under section 552.130. We note that the submitted information contains the requestor's State of Texas identification number. Under section 552.023 of the Government Code, a person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests. Gov't Code § 552.023(a). Section 552.130 is designed to protect the privacy interest of the individual to whom the information relates. The requestor has a special right of access under section 552.023 to her own confidential information.² Therefore, you must release the requestor's information to the requestor.

In summary, the social security number contained in the submitted information may be confidential under federal law. You must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. You must release the remaining information to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days.

² In this instance, the requestor has a special right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code to her own information. We note, however, that should the department receive another request for this same information from a person who would not have a special right of access to it, the department should resubmit this same information and request another ruling.

Id. § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Jennifer E. Berry".

Jennifer E. Berry
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JEB/sdk

Ref: ID# 196288

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Paula Farkhojasteh
14222 Dallas Parkway #1050
Dallas, Texas 75254
(w/o enclosures)